



## National Animal Ethics Advisory Committee

### The National Animal Ethics Advisory Committee

Te Komiti Tohutohu Matatika Kararehe ā-Motu

**General Meeting / Tikanga hui**

**Date / Rā:** 27 May 2025

**Time/ Tāima:** 9.30 am to 4.00 pm

**Venue / Whaitua o rēhia:** Microsoft Teams

### MINUTES / MINETI

**Committee/Komiti:** Natalie Waran (Chairperson/Kairuruku), Jessica Walker, Laura Bennet, Janine Duckworth, Jacquie Harper, Mike King, Nita Harding, Timothy Kelly, Jim Webster and Joanne Holter.

**Attendees/Nuinga:** s9(2)(a) (Manager, Animal Welfare), s9(2)(a) (Manager, Animal Welfare Systems) and s9(2)(a) (Senior Adviser, Animal Welfare Systems).

**Guests / Manuhiri:** None

**Public attendees / Tūmatanui tangata I tae atu:** None

**Welcome/Nau mai:** N Waran opened the meeting at 9:32 am and T Kelly provided the opening karakia.

**Apologies/Matangaro:** L Bennet (until 10:30 am - present after)

**Any Other Business Part One (Open to the Public):** No additional items of business were identified for discussion under Part One of the agenda.

## Committee Member Register of Interests

<b>Member</b>	<b>Interest declared</b>	<b>Role</b>
Natalie Waran	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Companion Animals New Zealand</li> <li>• NZEHA Equine Ethics and Welfare subcommittee</li> </ul>	Employee Member
Timothy Kelly	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Hurunui College</li> <li>• University of Canterbury</li> </ul>	Head of Science and Agriculture Adjunct fellow (Psychology)
Joanne Holter	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• MSD Animal Health</li> <li>• NZ Veterinary Association</li> <li>• Schering Plough Animal Ethics Committee</li> </ul>	Technical & Aftersales Manager Member Chair
Mike King	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Australian and New Zealand Council for the Care of Animals in Research and Teaching</li> <li>• International Council for Laboratory Animal Science Oceania Regional Committee</li> <li>• Zoo and Aquarium Association Ethics Committee</li> <li>• University of Otago</li> </ul>	Board Member Member Member Employee
Laura Bennet	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• University of Auckland</li> </ul>	Head of Department of Physiology Deputy Chair of the University of Auckland AEC
Jacquie Harper	-	-
Janine Duckworth	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Manaaki Whenua Landcare Research</li> </ul>	Senior Researcher, Wildlife Ecology and Management Team Chair of Manaaki Whenua Landcare Research AEC
James Webster	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• EthicoNZ Ltd</li> <li>• Beyond Animal Research</li> </ul>	Employee Advisor
Nita Harding	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• AgResearch Animal Ethics Committee</li> <li>• K9 Medical Detection New Zealand</li> <li>• New Zealand Veterinary Association</li> </ul>	Member Trustee Member
Jessica Walker	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• SPCA New Zealand</li> <li>• AgResearch Animal Ethics Committee</li> <li>• Waikato University Animal Ethics Committee</li> <li>• Waikato Institute of Technology Animal Ethics Committee</li> <li>• New Zealand Companion Animal Trust</li> <li>• Rodeo Animal Welfare Committee</li> <li>• Companion Animals New Zealand Animal Welfare Subcommittee</li> </ul>	National Science Manager SPCA Nominated Member SPCA Nominated Member SPCA Representative Member SPCA Representative Member SPCA Representative Member Member

## PART ONE (OPEN TO THE PUBLIC)

### 01 Welcome

N Waran opened the meeting at 9:32 am and welcomed attendees.

### 02 Confirmation of previous minutes

The draft minutes from the general meeting held on 3 February 2025 were reviewed. The committee reviewed the minutes page by page. There were no amendments.

*Moved (N Waran/M King): That the draft minutes of the meeting held on 3 February 2024 be adopted as a true and accurate record of that meeting.*

*The motion was put: carried.*

N Waran noted that the current agenda order may lead to corrections relevant to the closed session of a previous meeting being discussed in the current meeting's open section. N Waran suggested that going forward, if public attendees are present at a meeting, any amendments to the previous meeting's closed session minutes be discussed in the closed session.

### 03 Status of actions arising from previous meetings

The committee reviewed the status of actions agreed to at previous meetings. The following updates were provided:

**Action 3: N Waran suggested fish as a topic.**

**Action for secretariat: arrange a meeting between N Waran and M Stone (NAEAC) to discuss a joint meeting on fish.**

Action 10: J Duckworth would like further guidance on the process for sending out site visit letters. The committee discussed how to choose which locations to visit going forward – N Waran suggested it could be because of time since the last visit, member special interest, or proximity.

Action 17: ~~s9(2)(a)~~ noted that this still needed to be discussed within MPI and would do so shortly with ~~s9(2)~~.

Action 19: N Waran noted there hadn't been progress on this and queried whether NAEAC needed a formal stakeholder engagement strategy.

M King noted that J Webster had not yet attended a full NAEAC meeting and asked him to provide NAEAC with a full introduction. J Webster introduced himself and his background.

### 04 NAEAC correspondence

J Walker left the meeting at 9:58am.

The correspondence log circulated prior to the meeting was noted.

N Waran noted an email had been received from NZAVS introducing their new CE and asked that to be circulated to NAEAC in the next weekly update.

M King asked for more information on the OIA received into the NAEAC inbox and related to schools. s9(2)(g)

## **05 MPI update**

The MPI update was circulated prior to the meeting.

s9(2) introduced herself as the new manager of Animal Welfare at MPI, replacing s9(2). She provided her personal and professional background to NAEAC and noted that she started in her current role three weeks prior.

s9(2) highlighted the following aspects of the MPI update verbally:

- s9(2) had left her role as Manager Animal Welfare at MPI and was now working as the Private Secretary to the Hon A Hoggard.
- s9(2)(a) had returned from an overseas trip and had resumed his work at MPI and for the Prime Minister.
- The Code of Welfare: Sheep and Beef Cattle went out for public consultation on 14 May and closes on the 15<sup>th</sup> of July.
- Work was continuing on the drafting of the Code of Welfare: Rodeo.
- MPI is working to respond to two different select committee petitions: one on a ban on the use of shock collars and another relating to virtual fencing technologies.

J Walker rejoined the meeting.

## **06 MPI summary of CEC approvals, notifications, and revocations**

The summary of CEC approvals, notifications and revocations circulated prior to the meeting was discussed.

s9(2)(a) noted that in some cases MPI was seeking legal advice on whether amendments were considered major or minor under the Act and that over the next few months MPI expected the mergers of the CRI's to lead to work in the CEC space.

## **07 Subcommittee updates**

An update on subcommittee (SC) membership and focus was provided as follows:

3 Rs SC

This SC is not reconvening until 2026 for the next round of applications related to the 3 Rs award.

"Other publications" SC –

This SC will take on publication work that is not related to the Good Practice Guide (GPG).

N Harding would like this SC to revise the CEC template and the CEC review process.

s9(2)(a) asked that if any SC would like to meet to let the secretariat know and provide an agenda.

*PGP SC*

M King updated that this SC had revised the GPG and that those revisions were now with MPI for consideration. s9(2)(a) noted that feedback from MPI would arrive shortly.

M King also noted that there is a Terms of Reference document for each SC, and that these may need to be updated to reflect that the old “publications” SC is now specific to the GPG and a new “other publications” SC has been stood up.

**Action for the secretariat: Schedule a meeting between MPI and the GPG SC to discuss feedback on proposed revisions.**

**Action for the NAEAC: Update the Terms of Reference documents for the publications-related subcommittees.**

*AEC Training and Workshops SC*

M King asked to be removed from the SC and suggested new member J Webster as a replacement. J Webster accepted this proposal.

**Action for the secretariat: Update the register of SC members to reflect this change.**

**08 Committee members' reports on recent presentations and attendance at conferences**

N Waran invited committee members to comment on recent presentations and attendance at conferences since the last general meeting. The following updates were provided:

J Duckworth attended AWNA in March 2025 and spoke about new technologies related to pest control.

N Waran noted a new network had been stood up related to advancing animal welfare in New Zealand (New Zealand Animal Welfare Science Network). N Waran also recently attended a conference in California, USA on humane practices for sport horses.

T Kelly noted that he had been in talks with the Ministry of Education about ethics requirements for school projects that use other school children as “subjects” (ie, for psychology projects). Initial talks seem to indicate these projects would not require human ethics approval. This may confuse teachers if NAEAC puts out guidance on seemingly stricter requirements for animal ethics approval for school children than is required for human/survey projects. The Committee noted this as a valid concern.

**09 Draft 2024 Annual Report**

A final draft of the 2024 annual report had been circulated prior to the meeting. NAEAC offered the following feedback to be fixed prior to distribution:

- Page 2: Minor edit in chair’s comment, corrected in situ.
- Page 2: change “represent” to “represents” in the second to final line of the page.
- Page 14: edit the joint meeting section to include the meeting with ANZCARRT.
- Membership table: edit the “1” footnote to refer to all members with the same term expiry as N Waran.

*Moved (Nat/Jacquie):*

*To amend the report per the above changes and send to the Minister.*

*The motion was put: carried.*

#### **O10 Zebrafish recommendation**

N Waran referred committee members to the memo and draft letter to the Minister circulated prior to the meeting. N Waran recounted the content of the previous working group meeting to the wider Committee and asked for feedback on the draft letter to the Minister.

M King suggested an executive summary be added to the front of the letter better outlining the problem by defining sentience, touching on the long title of the Act, and stating how this letter fits in with the purpose of the long title.

J Harper asked if putting a proposed timeframe on the actions in the letter might assist in adding a sense of urgency or emphasising the need for some decision to be made on the topic. The Committee agreed to this and suggested adding in "before the end of 2025".

Point 9 – J Webster offers that this may be a good place to ensure the logic of the letter is laid out stepwise.

Points 11-14 – the secretariat needs to clarify whether these sentences should refer to "fish" or "zebrafish".

J Walker asked what was NAEAC's plan if the Minister decides not to progress or support this recommendation. N Waran indicates that if they do not receive Ministerial approval, they should enquire as to why not and make future decisions from there.

*Moved (Nat/Janine):*

*The letter be amended regarding a concise executive summary, adding in a timeline, checking the wording of points 11-14 (zebrafish vs fish), add in the definition of sentience, and then be signed and approved to go to the Minister. There should also be a request for a meeting with Minister to discuss the contents of the letter further added in.*

*The motion was put: carried.*

N Waran noted that the letter will be approved after editing by the working group (J Webster, J Duckworth, and N Waran), not the full Committee.

**Action for the secretariat: update the draft letter as above and send to the zebrafish working group for approval.**

M King advised that ~~s~~9(2)(a) from the University of Otago would be a good contact for any future targeted engagement on zebrafish research.

#### **O11 On farm teaching**

N Waran referred committee members to the memo that was circulated prior to the meeting. The purpose of the memo was to guide a discussion on NAEAC's approach to drafting formal advice for animal ethics committees (AECs) regarding their responsibilities related to on farm teaching.

The Committee discussed ways to make guidance for on-farm teaching clearer for AECs, particularly the inclusion of examples in the guidance they produce.

S9(2)(f)(iv) [REDACTED]

M King noted this document may be a useful starting point: [Visio-Need for Ethical Approval diagram-V2.vsd](#)

J Webster suggested that on-farm examples could be added to the flowchart. He also noted the gray area between on-the-job training and on-farm teaching as a point for clarification. N Waran noted that this issue also came up during NAEAC's visit to s9(2)(a) [REDACTED] in 2024.

**Action for the secretariat: Add an agenda item to the August meeting to check-in on how this workstream/SC is progressing.**

NAEAC queried how work on the s9(2)(a) [REDACTED] was progressing. S9(2)(f)(iv) [REDACTED]

## 012 NAWAC update

N Waran provided an update on NAWAC's work programme. The following matters were noted:

- Proposed Codes of Welfare for pigs and deer have been recommended to the Minister for issue.
- The Code of Welfare: Dairy Cattle is with NAWAC at the request of the Minister to reconsider a few key matters. NAWAC aims to send it back to the Minister for issue in mid-2025.
- The Code of Welfare: Rodeo remains in the drafting stage with the SC attending lots of training and rodeo visits. The SC hopes to recommend the Code go to the Minister for approval for public consultation at the end of the year.

- The Wildlife SC undertook work last year on updating pest control guidelines.
- There are no significant updates to report on any potential NAWAC reforms.
- NAWAC has been asked for and provided advice to the Minister on live animal export by sea as part of targeted engagement to key stakeholders

### **O13 2024 Three Rs Award**

**s9(2)(a)** provided an update on the 2024 3 Rs Award. The following matters were noted: At the ANZCARRT meeting a fortnight ago the 2024 cycle of the award ended with the presentation of awards to recipients. Awardees also presented on their work to ANZCARRT and NAEAC.

J Harper flagged the possibility of looking into a “where are they now” piece of work with previous applicants and recipients. **s9(2)(a)** suggested this could be included in the NAEAC newsletter and would fit well within the publications SC.

M King and N Waran noted that the NAEAC website should have the previous winners added to it for public reference.

**Action for the secretariat: add previous winners of the 3 Rs award to the NAEAC website.**

**Action for the secretariat: send J Harper a list of previous winners.**

### **O14 OIA obligations**

For the benefit of new committee members, **s9(2)(a)** provided an overview of NAEAC's obligations under the Official Information and Privacy Acts.

### **O15 AEC Site Visits 2025**

**s9(2)(a)** provided an update on the 2025 AEC site visit. The following matters were noted:

The site visits in May 2025 were cancelled due to an inability for many members of NAEAC to attend in person. They will be rescheduled for later in the year, taking advantage of dates already in member calendars for future joint meetings.

**s9(2)(a)** proposed to gather AEC members at Te Herenga Waka – Victoria University of Wellington as a centralised point for discussion and familiarisation among Wellington AEC members as part of the 2025 site visits.

N Waran noted the theme or interest for this year's site visits is training.

### **O16 AEC training webinar subjects and speakers**

The Committee discussed potential ideas for this year's webinar series. Several topics, such as the accredited reviewer process and teaching at schools were discussed as topics that may be helpful to AECs. The use of breakout rooms to foster further conversation at webinars was also discussed and decided that this may be more helpful for longer meetings.

The subcommittee decided on three topics for the 2025 webinar series:

- Impact grading and consistency (J Duckworth, J Walker, and J Webster)

- You have a non-compliance, now what? (J Webster and N Harding)
- Good decision-making for AECs, including consensus (L Bennet and M King)

**Action for the secretariat:** s9(2)(a) will socialise three dates for the webinars in the weekly roundup for NAEAC review.

#### **O17 Human-based research technologies**

N Waran invited M King to lead the discussion of this agenda item. The following was noted: M King takes the email he distributed to the Committee as read. A discussion followed on whether work in this area fits in the remit of NAEAC or is more appropriate for another body such as ANZCARRT.

N Waran suggests that NAEAC's role at this time is to stay informed, particularly of any action taken in this space by ANZCARRT.

N Waran asked if s9(2)(a) could provide ANZCARRT updates to NAEAC as relevant.

There being no other business to discuss, N Waran thanked everyone for their attendance and closed the meeting at 2:31 pm. J Halter performed the closing karakia.