



National Animal Ethics Advisory Committee

The National Animal Ethics Advisory Committee

Te Komiti Tohutohu Matatika Kararehe ā-Motu

General Meeting / Tikanga hui

Date / Rā: 26 February 2024

Time / Tāima: 9.00 am – 2:30 pm

Venue / Whaitua o rēhia: via Microsoft Teams

Minutes / Meneti

Committee / Komiti: Natalie Waran (Chairperson/Kairuruku), Jessica Walker, Laura Bennet, Janine Duckworth, Jacque Harper, Mike King, Nita Harding, Rachel Heeney, Dianne Wepa, Joanne Holter

Attendees / Nuinga: s9(2)(a)

[Redacted names]

Guests / Manuhiri: None.

Public Attendees / Tūmatanui tangata I tae atu: None.

Apologies / Matangaro: None.



National Animal Ethics Advisory Committee

PART ONE (OPEN TO THE PUBLIC)

GENERAL

O 1. Welcomes and Farewells

N Waran opened the meeting at 09:04am and R Heeney gave the opening karakia. N Waran welcomed all members and attendees to the first general meeting for 2024 and asked members to update their register of interests if required.

O 2. Confirmation of previous minutes

The documents [02.24 and 03.24] were circulated prior to the meeting and taken as read. The committee reviewed each set of draft minutes in turn.

D Wepa joined at 09:09am.

MOTION

Moved: (J Harper / M King)

That the minutes dated 28 November are a true and accurate record.

The motion was put: carried.

MOTION

Moved: (J Duckworth / M King)

That the minutes dated 27 October 2024 are a true and accurate record.

The motion was put: carried.

O 3. Status of actions arising from previous meetings

The document [04.24] was circulated prior to the meeting and taken as read. The committee reviewed the actions list one action at a time.

O 4. NAEAC correspondence

The document [05.24] was circulated prior to the meeting and taken as read. s9(2)(a) confirmed the function and process of the NAEAC inbox. The Secretariat provided



National Animal Ethics Advisory Committee

clarification on advice provided for a few correspondence items, regarding the level of detail and normal process.

O 5. MPI update and discussion

The document [06.24] was circulated prior to the meeting and taken as read.

s9(2)(a) talked to the MPI update and that there is a further vacancy in the science team. MPI are currently waiting for budget approvals. The Secretariat have secured meetings for the NAEAC and NAWAC chairpersons with the Minister. s9(2)(a) provided clarification on the process when the Minister receives advice on the same topic from different parties, including MPI and the committees, noting that the Minister considers all advice in making decisions.

O 6. MPI summary of CEC approvals, notification, and revocations

The document [07.24] was circulated prior to the meeting and taken as read.

N Waran spoke to the notifications memo. The Secretariat confirmed that six CECs will be up for review in 2024. The committee discussed the disestablishment of Te Pūkenga and the implications on NAEAC CEC reviews. The Secretariat confirmed they are ensuring that anyone that is working with animals are supported and covered to either begin the process of establishing a CEC or entering a parenting arrangement. The Secretariat confirmed they will keep NAEAC updated on any impacts to NAEAC's workload.

s9(2)(a) confirmed that when MPI are approached with a request to establish a new CEC, the first process is to engage with them on whether a parenting arrangement would be more appropriate.

A query regarding a fish Code of Welfare was raised. The committee briefly discussed the work plan of NAWAC and how Codes of Welfare reviews are prioritised. s9(2)(a) confirmed that NAWAC's updated workplan is being deliberated at their upcoming meeting. s9(2)(a) noted that an ongoing consideration of the Secretariat is not only of MPI's resourcing but also NAWAC's. The priority currently is to get existing Codes under review across the line to free up capacity.

R Heeney queried an update regarding the report of the environment select committee on the petition of Erika Rowlands. s9(2) provided an update that a cross-government approach is being utilised to prepare a joint briefing which will go to Minister. s9(2) confirmed she is happy to forward over any updates. N Waran spoke to cat



National Animal Ethics Advisory Committee

management from a Companion Animal's New Zealand perspective, and then moved on to speak about an additional workstream on a national register for equine registration which is in progress.

O 7. Update from NAEAC subcommittees

N Waran called for subcommittee (SC) updates. She also noted that in the first meeting for 2024, SCs should confirm their Terms of Reference and set their objectives for the year so that progress against these can be talked to at each general meeting. N Waran shared that that she would like a strong focus on the 3Rs in 2024.

3Rs subcommittee: The committee discussed whether ANZCCART members of this SC should be changed every year, to allow NAEAC to engage with different ANZCCART members moving forward and strengthen the NAEAC-ANZCCART relationship. M King spoke to this and confirmed he was happy to approach ANZCCART on this to open this discussion. N Waran asked the 3Rs SC to discuss this at their first meeting. J Harper confirmed she will Chair the SC for the first meeting.

Operation of Part 6 SC: N Harding noted there have been no meetings of this SC yet in 2024, however she has reviewed their workplan. N Harding noted that the SC will aim to re-survey code holders regarding the CEC Application Pack towards the end of the year, targeting the six which have CEC's up for review. She noted that some things are dependent on the NAEAC website being updated, e.g., asking an AEC Chair to provide a parenting blurb for the NAEAC website, and preparing an article for the NAEAC newsletter. There is also a workstream planned on how to strengthen parenting arrangements.

Publications SC: M King shared that the Secretariat did a terrific job reviewing the GPG, making this revision of the GPG the largest in M King's time on the committee. He noted work going on between the committee and Secretariat regarding streamlining future review processes, with milestones for different points in the year. He reminded the committee of the meeting scheduled for 22 March for the full committee to approve the GPG. The Secretariat updated that the Legal team had completed a review of the GPG, which no major concerns. M King queried whether the Publications SC could meet with the Legal team.

Website and digital presence SC: N Waran noted that a key focus for the SC is ensuring that website maintenance is done as required, with further work to be discussed at the first meeting of the SC.

AEC training and workshop SC: N Waran noted that the workplan for the SC will be reviewed based on discussions later in the agenda today.



National Animal Ethics Advisory Committee

Mātauranga Māori SC: D Wepa noted she will engage with the Secretariat to set up the first meeting for 2024.

Animals in teaching SC: R Heeney noted the SC haven't met in 2024, and that work is still ongoing with gazette article. N Waran called the SC to think how the committee could provide independent resources for educators to sit on the website.

Rehoming guidelines SC: N Harding raised there is already guidance on the website which links to an extensive document from the New South Wales Department of Primary Industries. There is also information in the GPG. She noted that in her opinion, there may not be value in re-writing information that already exists in the extensive NSW guideline. N Harding confirmed she will set up a SC meeting to talk through this, to decide whether the SC should be retired. N Waran agreed with this approach and raised whether all guidelines and resources could be folded into the Publications SC.

The committee discussed whether a zebrafish SC should be established. N Waran spoke to this, noting firstly whether something should be prepared for her meeting with the Minister regarding zebrafish. s9(2) provided advice on how to frame the zebrafish advice for more impact. s9(2)(a) suggested the committee consider establishing a general SC focused on advice to the Minister, rather than a zebrafish-focused SC, so that there is scope within the group to work on broader issues. s9(2) and s9(2)(a) would be the MPI Secretariat contacts for this SC. N Waran noted that her meeting with the Minister will be brief and aimed at an initial meeting to bring the Minister up to speed on NAEAC's role and key priorities. She noted she will explain the relevance of the 3Rs, including the importance of funding and incentivisation, and thanked s9(2) for her offer of assistance to get the messaging right when touching on zebrafish. The Secretariat confirmed that the Minister will get a briefing prior to the meeting and that the Secretariat will set up a meeting prior to confirm talking points.

Actions:

- All SCs to have a meeting in early 2024 to confirm ToR, objectives, and meeting dates for 2024.



National Animal Ethics Advisory Committee

O 8. Members' reports on recent presentations and attendance at conferences

Nat called for committee members reports on activity since the November meeting, or upcoming activity.

s9(2)(a) noted the upcoming Companion Animal's New Zealand and Equitation conferences, and ANZLAA and ANZCARRT conferences later in the year.

The committee discussed whether a workstream or issues register regarding artificial intelligence and how their application may impact the RTT space (e.g., in research or even ethical decision making) should be noted. It was discussed that this could be included in the AEC workshop agenda.

N Waran shared that she has been invited to be the Cam Reid Orator for the ANZCCART conference. J Duckworth and R Heeney will also attend ANZCCART. s9(2)(a) asked members to contact the Secretariat as soon as possible after receiving invitations or expressing interest to attend conferences.

M King shared that he will be speaking at AWNA in March.

Actions:

- Secretary to create a list of relevant conferences for 2024 for members awareness.

The committee adjourned for morning tea at 10:30am.

The meeting reconvened at 10:50am.

FOR APPROVAL

O 9. Draft 2023 Annual Report

The document [08.24] was circulated prior to the meeting and taken as read.

N Waran noted that the Chairs comment was not yet included in the circulated draft.

All members confirmed they were happy with membership list and fees. N Waran noted that fees claimed against her name weren't reflective of her real hours, as she hadn't claimed for all hours.



National Animal Ethics Advisory Committee

s9(2)(a) spoke to NAEAC appointments for 2024 and that the Secretariat hope to begin the appointments process soon. s9(2)(a) noted that senior leadership will be speaking with the Minister regarding appointments, but that nothing can be progressed until the Minister has provided direction. It was re-iterated that there is a statutory requirement for members to continue to serve until a replacement has been appointed.

The committee discussed wording of the section describing progress against statutory activities, including the term recommendation versus advice. It was noted that under a few activities, no requests for advice were made to NAEAC by the Minister in 2023. N Waran noted that the topic of proactive advice to the Minister could be discussed during the workplan discussion later in the agenda.

The committee requested elaboration on the justification and impact of the sections detailing AEC site visits, AEC meeting attendance, and openness agreements.

N Waran confirmed that she can acknowledge retiring accredited reviewers in her Chairs comment.

The committee agreed to remove the reference to the NZAVS Executive Director's name and the specific campaign points from the annual report.

N Waran called for other members to report on any conference activity to be included.

N Waran spoke to the intended contents for the Chairs comments, including:

- Noting the updated strategic plan.
- Work progress in 2023.
- Recognising the importance of maintaining social license to use animals in RTT and public confidence that animal welfare is protected.
- Touching on progress of encouraging the 3Rs, including reference to the AEC Chairs meeting and 3Rs discussion.
- Finishing off with touching on zebrafish, framing it as raising that conversations continue on the subject.

The committee discussed and agreed to keep the Chairs comment concise and focused to NAEAC's 'business as usual' workstreams.

MOTION

Moved: (J Harper / J Walker)

That the committee approved the draft Annual Report with the discussed amendments for publishing and furnishing to the Minister.

The motion was put: carried.



National Animal Ethics Advisory Committee

Actions:

- Secretary to amend the annual report as discussed and send to the Chair for approval and for inclusion of Chair's comment.

OTHER BUSINESS

O 10. Deputy Chair 2024

N Waran spoke to the deputy Chair election for 2024.

MOTION

Moved: (N Waran / J Holter)

That Jacquie Harper be re-elected as NAEAC Deputy Chair for 2024.

The motion was put: carried.

O 11. NAWAC Update

N Waran introduced that as she sits across both committees, she is best positioned to provide an update, to improve transparency and reporting between committees. N Waran provided a brief verbal update of NAWAC's current work streams.

M King noted that NAEAC may want to feed into the animal sentience opinion piece and queried whether NAEAC and NAWAC may want to collaborate. It was flagged that these may be topics for future joint meetings.

O 12. 2024 Three Rs Award

The document [09.24] was circulated prior to the meeting and taken as read.

N Waran touched on the 2024 awards cycle, and that the process has been established in the circulated memo. s9(2)(a) noted that each box on the process map summary is broken down into a multitude of smaller steps, which includes recognition of ANZCCART's role in the process as well as in the award Terms of Reference.

N Waran raised the topic of funding for the award. M King noted that NAEAC should reach out to ANZCCART to confirm the budget. s9(2)(a) confirmed that NAEAC have \$5000 committed via their MPI budget, and that the next step would be to confirm with ANZCCART their share of the budget. It was noted that the Secretariat are happy to draft the letter, which can be attributed to N Waran and sent to ANZCCART NZ.



National Animal Ethics Advisory Committee

Actions:

- Secretariat to draft a letter to ANZCCART NZ to confirm the 3Rs award budget.

O 13. AEC meeting visit allocation

The document [10.24] was circulated prior to the meeting and taken as read.

N Waran spoke to the document. The Secretariat provided a table with AEC meeting dates for a range of AECs for members to utilise when arranging visits for 2024. It was noted that members should indicate which AEC they would like visit and that it falls to them to arrange the visit.

It was noted that many meetings are available online.

The following visit schedule was agreed.

- R Heeney: University of Auckland.
- J Harper: Victoria University, SPAH, and Lincoln University.
- M King: NZASE
- N Harding: Auckland Zoo.
- N Waran: Massey University.
- J Duckworth: AgResearch and NMIT.
- J Walker: DOC and NIWA.
- L Bennet: AgResearch.
- J Holter: Waikato University.
- D Wepa: Otago University.

Actions:

- Secretary to circulate noted names against AECs and circulate contacts.
- Secretary to draft an introductory letter for NAEAC members to use when engaging with AECs for meeting visits.

O 14. AEC Site Visits May 2024

The document [10.24] was circulated prior to the meeting and taken as read. N Waran proposed Christchurch as the site visit location. It was noted that site visits in 2023 were facilities-focused and N Waran would like a stronger focus on the 3Rs for 2024. The



National Animal Ethics Advisory Committee

Secretariat confirmed host organisations will be given a clear scope for the visits. The Secretariat will draft up a letter when first engaging.

J Duckworth noted that she is happy to host the committee. The dates were confirmed as 20th and 21st May.

The committee discussed options of Lincoln University, Landcare Research, University of Otago, or University of Canterbury.

The Secretariat confirmed they will review travel logistics when finalising host organisations.

The committee adjourned for lunch at 12:08pm

M King left the meeting at 12:08pm.

The committee reconvened at. 12:45pm

O 15. Strategic plan 2024-2028

The document [11.24] was circulated prior to the meeting and taken as read. N Waran introduced the updated format.

The committee discussed the following required amendments:

- The white font in the coloured segments may be difficult to read.
- The committee agreed to the inclusion of the Te Reo name for the committee.
- Review punctuation.

The committee discussed the writing style within the plan which utilises bullet-points to summarise the key actions. It was noted this speaks to the committee being transparent about NAEAC's activities and framing the activities in line with NAEAC's remit.

The committee reviewed the bullet-points under the first quadrant on advancing public confidence, and whether to remove the phrase 'remove barriers and improve understanding'. The committee discussed how NAEAC can actively remove barriers as an advisory committee. The committee agreed it was comfortable with retaining this, as the committee encourages transparency, openness agreement, and plain English which all remove barriers to knowledge exchange and improving understanding.

The committee discussed the colour theme of the strategy and whether a monotone theme would be cleaner. It was noted the theme should be reviewed in the context of accessibility, including ensuring the document was text-to-speech accessible.

s9(2)(a) noted specific parts of the document that could be trimmed from a wordsmithing perspective. N Waran acknowledged crossover in the points raised by s



National Animal Ethics Advisory Committee

s9(2)(a) but noted previous discussion at the SC level to retain these bullet points. The strategic plan sits to guide NAEAC's workplan, which is why the activities are spelled out in more detail.

N Waran asked the Secretariat to engage with the design team regarding the necessary amendments. The committee agreed that the SC will review the plan after amendments are made and can approve the plan to publish on behalf of the committee.

Actions:

- Secretariat to engage with the design team regarding feedback received from NAEAC on various design elements.

O 16. Workplan 2024

The documents [12.24 and 13.24] was circulated prior to the meeting and taken as read.

N Waran noted the committee will need an updated workplan that aligns with the updated strategic plan for the same 5-year period. Following this, NAEAC will then focus on what will be addressed in 2024. N Waran re-iterated that the focus for 2024 is the 3Rs, which can be fed into AEC site visits and AEC workshops. She called for the committee to deliberate on what specific outcomes the committee wants to achieve in 2024, noting some activities are business as usual.

J Harper raised what outcomes the committee would like to achieve around providing clear accessible information and communications in 2024. N Waran noted that the social media plan was dropped due to logistics and that the website refresh is in progress.

N Waran noted that the workplan will be shared in due course and called for members to send in ideas relating to their SC work streams.

O 17. NAEAC Subcommittees

The committee agreed that this agenda was no longer required as SC organisation for 2024 was already touched on earlier in the agenda.

O 18. AEC Workshop 2024

The document [14.24] was circulated prior to the meeting and taken as read.



National Animal Ethics Advisory Committee

N Waran talked to this AEC workshop scheduled for Friday 18 October and that the committee need to decide on a theme and location.

s9(2)(a) noted that if NAEAC want to propose an in-person workshop, Wellington would guarantee the greatest number of MPI support. She updated that strides can be made towards an in-person workshop, but this cannot be confirmed until the budget is approved mid-2024.

N Waran noted that a hybrid or fully online approach could be utilised, as funding may constrain in-person attendance for many AEC members. N Waran also raised the option of breaking the workshop down into smaller meetings throughout the year online to encourage greater engagement.

N Harding queried whether feedback surveys were completed on previous events and noted that she was in favour of utilising an online approach and having a webinar every quarter. It was noted that in-person attendance may compete with ANZCCART with regards to funding for members to attend.

The committee discussed planning 2-3 shorter webinars throughout the year to trial this format. The committee agreed to the below themes:

- Impact grading and consistency, utilising case studies.
- Data collected regarding 3Rs and how this is being tracked, alongside an open discussion about barriers for AEC members.
- Non-compliance, utilising scenario examples and discussing what would be the response based on the example of the non-compliance and the outcome.

The committee agreed that the webinars should include a brief talk, an exercise, and a discussion, with a proposed duration of 90 minutes, scheduled in May/June, August, and November.

It was noted that NAEAC would need to ensure AEC members would sign up for them and could approach AEC Chairs to encourage attendance.

Before the meeting was closed, N Harding raised a report via an AEC Chair that there is concern regarding vets carrying out research on-farm within startup companies, without having AEC approval. N Harding shared that she has set up a call with veterinary contacts to have a preliminary chat to ensure that vets are appropriately informed, noting that startups should have all relevant information but is not sure how to ensure this. N Harding noted she will update NAEAC on discussions and progress, which may result in a notice in newsletters for vets. N Waran asked N Harding to consider this in relation to content on the NAEAC website and if anything needs to be developed.



National Animal Ethics Advisory Committee

N Waran closed the meeting at 13.36pm and R Heeney provided the closing karakia.

Actions:

- NAEAC and Secretariat to progress planning of the 2024 AEC mini-webinar series.

RELEASED UNDER THE OFFICIAL INFORMATION ACT 1982