



# National Animal Ethics Advisory Committee

NAEAC 18 / 23

**Te Komiti Tohutohu Matatika Kararehe ā-Motu**  
**Tikanga hui: General Meeting**

**Rā: 08 February 2023**  
**Tāima: 9.00 am – 3.00 pm**

**Whaitua o rēhia: Microsoft Teams Videoconference**

## Meneti | Minutes

**Komiti / Committee:** Natalie Waran (Chairperson), Jessica Walker, Laura Bennet, Janine Duckworth, Jo Holter, Jacque Harper, Mike King, Nita Harding, Rachel Heeney, and Dianne Wepa.

**Nuinga / Attendees:** s9(2)(a)

[Redacted Attendee List]

**Manuhiri / Guests:** s9(2)(a)

### Nau mai / Welcome

N Waran opened the meeting at 09:05am. J Duckworth opened with a Karakia. J Harper noted prior to the meeting that she would be slightly late.

### Matangaro / Apologies:

s9(2)(a)

### Any Other Business Part One (Open to the Public)

### Any Other Business Part Two (Public Excluded Agenda)

## PART ONE (OPEN TO THE PUBLIC)

### O 1. Welcomes

N Waran welcomed two newly appointed members to the NAEAC committee, J Walker and J Holter. J Holter has worked for MSD Animal Health NZ for the past 11 years in a number of areas. J Walker has an extensive background in Animal Welfare and is currently the National Science Manager for RNZSPCA.

The remainder of the committee and MPI attendees introduced themselves.

### O 2. Confirmation of previous minutes

The draft minutes of the general meeting held on 30 November 2022 were circulated prior to the meeting (02.22) and taken as read. NAEAC reviewed the minutes, and no changes were made.

*Moved: (M King / L Bennet)*

*That the draft minutes of the meeting held on 30 November 2022 be adopted as a true and accurate record.*

*The motion was put: carried.*

### O 3. Status of actions arising from previous meetings

The action list was circulated prior to the meeting (03.22).

Fourth R (respect) guideline approach - there has been a pending subcommittee around surgical models for some time, but this has morphed into something wider. The committee agreed to proceed by identifying the areas where this would be most applicable (e.g., dead animals, embryonic animals, pre-sentient animals), and that respect should be a part of the broader considerations of using animals in RTT.

**Action: M King to circulate draft fourth R paper to committee.**

**Action: Subcommittee to meet and proceed as discussed.**

s9(2)(a) plans to circulate the guideline document for Code Review Reports to the committee shortly.

Zebra Fish - N Waran has written to the minister a number of times with no action. s9(2)(a) reported that she has looked into this and provided an update. Altering the Zebra fish definition will likely result in an amendment to the act. This would need to be added to the list of amendments that will be presented to the minister in the next couple of years and is likely to be a lower priority than other current work programmes. The committee are concerned with the wide use of zebra fish in NZ and acknowledge that there would be a large impact on industries. The committee believe this is an important issue that as an advisory committee to the minister,

they need to pursue. The committee also understand that this would have an impact on NAWACs work programmes. N Waran will liaise with the NAWAC chair and draft a letter to the minister, with support from s9(2)(a)

J Harper joined the meeting at 09:38am.

**Action: N Waran to meet with NAWAC chair to discuss potential Zebrafish impacts if definition were to change.**

**Action: N Waran will write another letter to the minister, with support from s9(2)(a).**

Remaining actions were reviewed and updated accordingly.

#### **O 4. NAEAC correspondence**

s9(2)(a) provided the committee with an update on NAEAC correspondence. The new statistics return system was rolled out in December to enable people time to familiarise themselves with its operation. Positive feedback has been received and some helpful suggestions for making the system smoother in the future.

#### **O 5. MPI update**

The paper (04.23) was circulated prior to the meeting and taken as read.

s9(2)(a) updated NAEAC on recent staffing changes. s9(2)(a) has joined AWEM team on a 6month contract as Principal Adviser. s9(2)(a) has been appointed as Animal Welfare Science Principal Adviser and s9(2)(a) as Animal Welfare Senior Adviser. s9(2)(a) is a new Animal Welfare Senior Adviser joining the team in March. s9(2)(a) is returning end of Feb after extended leave. s9(2)(a) has been covering for s9(2)(a) on a secondment and will be leaving the team at this time. Recruitment is underway for a second Animal Welfare Science team manager to support the growth of the Animal Welfare Science teams.

N Waran requested feedback from the committee on verbal updates. Nothing to add.

#### **O 6. MPI summary of CEC approvals, notifications, and revocations**

The paper (05.23) was circulated prior to the meeting and taken as read.

N Waran requested feedback or questions from the committee on any aspects of the report provided. Nothing to add.

#### **O 7. Update from NAEAC sub-committees**

The Chair asked each sub-committee chair to report back on progress/updates on the workstreams and engagement (that hasn't been discussed prior in this meeting) since the last general meeting.

- NAEAC Publications (Good practice guide)  
Nothing further to report.

- Mātauranga Māori

Subcommittee will reconnect. N Waran met with NAWAC chair (M Stone) and they will be holding a meeting to discuss how this can be better incorporated within both committees and their work programmes. N Waran shared proposed objectives for this meeting with committee. Aim is to move this to a level where they can put things into practice.

- Surgical Models

Consider changing name of this subcommittee to Fourth R. Surgical models is no longer the main purpose of the SC.

**Action: Committee members to review Good Practice Guidelines and provide any feedback to subcommittee (M King, J Duckworth, J Walker) by Friday 17<sup>th</sup> February.** Subcommittee will then meet and finalise document to be uploaded.

The subcommittee list was shared on screen and updated accordingly;

- *Aotearoa New Zealand 3Rs Award* – J Holter joined, J Harper appointed as chair.
- *Operation of Part 6* – L Bennet joined; N Harding appointed as chair.
- *NAEAC Publications* – J Walker joined; M King appointed as chair.
- *AEC Training and Workshop* – J Walker joined. Chair still to be appointed.
- *Mātauranga Māori* – D Wepa appointed as chair.
- *Surgical Models* – R Heeney joined. Name of this subcommittee changed to *Fourth R*.

**Action: Website subcommittee to meet to discuss engagement.**

*The committee adjourned the meeting for morning tea at 10:26am.*

*The meeting reconvened at 10:44am.*

## **DISCUSSION**

### **O 8. NAEAC Annual Report 2022**

The Chair asked the committee for any suggestions of topics to be covered in the annual report for 2022.

Topics to include; AEC workshop, site visits, Insect Sentience workshop, 3Rs award, work that went into new stats reporting system, keeping website up to date (new things added, the number of newsletters circulated).

### **O 9. Support for Code Holders and Parenting Arrangements**

The memo (06.23) was circulated prior to the meeting and taken as read.

Aim is to provide all information in a clear and efficient manner, so the whole process runs smoothly for everyone involved. The committee has an opportunity to refine resources to support code holders as they carry out their work.

The question was posed whether obligations can be placed on parented organisations. Parented organisations already have obligations under the Act. The committee discussed making these clearer. The publications subcommittee can consider how to achieve this at the next review of the Good Practice Guidelines. The Chair of AECs needs to ensure that parented companies understand their obligations (this may require a physical visit to talk through the Code etc). N Harding suggests leaving parenting organisations to decide the best way to achieve this, but this needs to be very clear for the auditing process. The committee agree that parented organisations can be trusted to decide on the best approach. Act is set up in a way that says you can only do RTT if you have approval and being monitored is part of this.

The committee suggest clarifying within the Good Practice Guide that is applies to both parented and parenting organisations, and further outlining what the roles are of each (e.g., parented orgs need to make time for reviews).

The committee are happy for these suggestions to go to the subcommittee.

N Waran requested feedback from committee on any aspects of the memo provided. Nothing noted.

#### **O 10. Animal Production Regulation 118 Update**

s9(2)(a) joined the meeting to provide an update to the committee. They explained that this regulation has expanded in recent years. They are working to ensure that the intent of the regulation is clear and not misinterpreted and have pulled together a working group to research solutions. To date, the working group has produced guidance which is available online.

N Harding is happy with the progress made thus far on clarifying this regulation bit highlights that there is still some work to do.

N Waran noted that some AECs, and or, parented organisations. that aren't involved with production animals may not be aware of this regulation and how it applies to them. s9(2)(a)

s9(2)(a) agrees that this has been identified as a communication gap and will action contacting relevant organisations.

s9(2)(a) provided a link to a guidance document that provides further information and contact details for any questions. [Guidance Document: Animals used in Experiments, Trials, and Research \(mpi.govt.nz\)](https://www.mpi.govt.nz/guidance-document/animals-used-in-experiments-trials-and-research/)

N Waran thanked guests who left the meeting at 11:27am.

### **O 11. Social License to Operate – Animals in Teaching sub-committee**

The Chair nominated R Heeney to Chair this subcommittee. Other members volunteered to join the subcommittee - L Bennet, J Harper, M King. M King is also involved with ANZCCART working on something similar. N Waran recommends forming a Terms of Reference for this. Francesca Brown was mentioned as a useful contact.

*Moved: (N Waran / J Harper):*

*That Rachel Heeney is appointed as Chair of the Animals in Teaching subcommittee.*

*The motion was put: carried.*

### **O 12. NAEAC website and content**

s9(2)(a) has experience with usability and efficient communication and requested feedback and suggestions from the committee for what they would like to include on the website.

Committee would like to put more thought into the purpose of the website and ensure that information flows in an understandable order. Suggested using more hyperlinks as part of this. Identified that there are 3 groups to consider;

- The general public
- People who are thinking of doing RTT work and are looking for information
- AEC committees and research facilities.

The committee think that general information and then specific information for each group will be valuable and improve usability.

The committee will engage with a focus group for feedback and agreed to form a temporary group to advise and work with s9(2)(a) to decide on purpose and direction. Initial direction and changes will be shared and discussed with the committee at the April meeting – time to be scheduled for this in the agenda. N Harding volunteered to assist.

***Action: N Waran to chair a meeting and gather volunteers to be involved. Date to be confirmed.***

*The committee adjourned the meeting for lunch at 12:08pm.*

*The meeting reconvened at 12:38pm.*

### **FOR APPROVAL**

### **O 13. NAEAC Workplan 2023**

The paper (07.23) was circulated prior to the meeting and taken as read.

The committee discussed the workplan and updated;

- Engagement plan – website usability and audience. Newsletters will continue. Infographic has been signed off. Question around review of part 6.

- 2 CEC reviews are due in April.
- Regional visits – plan to view more AECs in May. Suggestion to divide the committee for visits, and individuals / sub-groups can report back, rather than whole committee going at once. More structured approach.

**Action: s9(2)(a) to circulate a list of code holders. Include when they were last visited, and committee members will allocate themselves to site visits.**

- CEC template – the committee can make recommendations based on their own work and needs. This (along with induction pack) will be reviewed in the second half of the year.
- Committee recognise that the future work programme (heading towards 2025) will need to be revised. For agenda later in the year.

**Action: Ensure that the timeline diagram has been updated.**

*Moved: (M King / J Harper):*

*That the NAEAC workplan has been reviewed and updated for the upcoming year, 2023.*

*The motion was put: carried.*

#### **O 14. RTT Infographics**

The paper (08.23) was circulated prior to the meeting and taken as read. s9(2)(a) requested feedback from the committee. Diagrams discussed and some changes suggested to clarify organisations roles and context. First diagram was favoured, with suggestion to add a title.

*Moved: (D Wepa / J Duckworth):*

*That the committee approve the infographic for use, subject to the addition of a title.*

*The motion was put: carried.*

#### **OTHER BUSINESS**

##### **O 15. Committee members' reports on recent presentations and attendance at conferences**

The Chair sought committee members reports on presentations they have done and conferences they have attended, and also requested any related links/documents to circulate to the committee.

N Harding will be attending a NIWA meeting later this month.

J Duckworth attended meeting with Lincoln University 7<sup>th</sup> December 2022. Noted positive, robust discussion and great internal support for their AEC.

N Waran Chairs an AEC which agreed to parent WINTEC. Combined AEC membership and research applications were different to usual. Noted being impressed with the kind of questions that were asked for clarification of applications.

s9(2)(a) raised a call that MPI received regarding use of cameras (drone and underwater) for whale observation and whether this combination fit within the parameters for manipulation. Reached out to parenting organisations who have expertise in this and wanted to highlight that they received outstanding assistance.

N Waran raised correspondence sent from Massey University regarding their code coming up for review at the end of the year and whether this can be achieved via an online videoconference. Wording has been adjusted in GPG around this which can be used as a response. Pros and cons of online meetings were discussed for awareness. Need to ensure that for a larger group online, that everyone's view is captured, and clear expectations should be set prior to the meeting.

#### **O 16. Deputy Chair Election**

The Chair explained the Deputy Chair role and sought volunteers and nominations for the role of NAEAC Deputy Chair. N Waran gave the committee 24 hours (till 2pm) to volunteer or nominate for the role. If no new nominations, J Harper will continue with this role. This will be formally confirmed via email. Committee all happy with this approach.

#### **O 17. NAEAC Expense Claims**

s9(2)(a) presented on expense claims, providing clarification on what can be claimed and how this is done. PowerPoint will be circulated to committee for reference. N Waran encouraged the committee to keep a clear record of their claims each month if they aren't already. M King asked for clarification on accommodation which s9(2)(a) provided – highlighted the importance of travel requests coming through with as much notice as possible (and ensuring they are correct, with no last-minute changes needing to be made), so the secretariat can provide the best possible options to support committee members.

***Action: Secretariat to circulate some examples for the committees' reference.***

A committee member questioned whether financial claims are public record.

***Action: Secretariat to follow this up and report back to committee.***

***Action: Secretariat to re-circulate meeting dates and locations.***

Any further questions can be directed to s9(2)(a) .



**PART TWO (PUBLIC EXCLUDED AGENDA)  
DRAFT RESOLUTION TO EXCLUDE THE PUBLIC**

*Section 48, Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987*

*There being no further introductory items of business to discuss, it was moved (M King / J walker):*

A: *That the public be excluded from the following parts of the proceedings of this meeting, namely:*

C 1. *NZeno Update*

*The general subject of each matter to be considered while the public is excluded, the reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter, and the specific grounds under section 48(1) of the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 for the passing of this resolution are as follows:*

<b>General subject of each matter to be considered</b>	<b>Reason for passing this resolution in relation to each matter</b>	<b>Ground(s) under section 48(1) for the passing of this resolution</b>
NZeno Update	To enable the local authority to deliberate in private on decisions or recommendations where it is required to make a recommendation by any enactment.	That the public conduct of the relevant part of the proceedings of the meeting would be likely to result in the disclosure of information for which good reason for withholding would exist under section 48(2)(a)(ii) of the OIA.

B: *I also move that s9(2)(a) [redacted] remain at this meeting after the public has been excluded, because of their knowledge of meeting procedure and the subject matter under consideration. This knowledge is relevant background information to assist the committee in its deliberations.*

*The motion was put: carried.*

s9(2)(ba)(i)

D Wepa closed the meeting with a karakia at 14:16pm.

**O 18. Joint meeting with ANZCCART**

Meeting convened at 15:00pm.

Minutes for this meeting were circulated by s9(2)(a) on 13<sup>th</sup> February 2023.

Other information to note;

- Shared infographic - ANZCCART would be happy to link this on their site.
- Waiting to hear back from s9(2)(a) regarding developing new three Rs booklets. s9(2)(a) will follow up with him.
- Openness Agreement - draft going to committee end of Feb. Then all signatories will be invited to a meeting to discuss how they can continue their journey to openness.
- **NAEAC to invite s9(2)(a) to present on ComPass.**
- **NAEAC to engage with s9(2)(a) regarding the joint Mātauranga Māori Workshop.**

RELEASED UNDER THE OFFICIAL INFORMATION ACT 1982