



National Animal Ethics Advisory Committee

Te Komiti Tohutohu Matatika Kararehe ā-Motu Tikanga hui: General Meeting

Rā: 15 November 2021
Tāima: 9.30 am – 4.00 pm
Via Microsoft Teams

Meneti | Minutes

Komiti/Committee: Natalie Waran (Chairperson), Arnja Dale, Laura Bennet, Janine Duckworth, Rob Hazelwood, Jacquie Harper, Mike King, Nita Harding, Rachel Heeney, and Dianne Wepa.

Nuinga/Attendees: Grant Shackell (former NAEAC Chairperson and acting Chair for the meeting),
9(2)(a)

and
Hon Meka Whitiri, Associate Minister Agriculture (Animal Welfare), for 5 minutes at 11.45 am

Nau mai/Welcome

G Shackell opened the meeting at 9.30 am and invited M King to perform the opening karakia. **9(2)(a)** reminded the committee that Hon Meka Whitiri would be joining the meeting briefly before 12 pm via Microsoft Teams. G Shackell reported he would swap the discussion of agenda items O4 and O5.

Matangaro/Apologies

There were no apologies.

Any Other Business Part One (Open to the Public)

No additional items of business were identified for discussion under Part One of the agenda.

Any Other Business Part Two (Public Excluded Agenda)

No items of business were identified for discussion under Part Two of the agenda.

PART ONE (OPEN TO THE PUBLIC)

O 1. Farewell to G Shackell and welcome to new committee members

G Shackell welcomed current and new NAEAC members to the meeting and MPI staff members. For the benefit of new committee members, G Shackell asked all present to introduce themselves.

N Waran introduced herself to attendees as the new committee Chairperson and thanked G Shackell for his support.

On behalf of NAEAC, R Hazelwood thanked G Shackell for his chairmanship of the committee over the last six years and acknowledged his ability to listen and respect fellow committee members, which demonstrated his value on people.

R Hazelwood noted that whilst G Shackell was Chairman, NAEAC had a clear drive to commit to delivering purposeful outcomes. He noted the reviewing of documentation as valuable, along with the dialogue NAEAC now have with the New Zealand Anti-Vivisection Society.

G Shackell has left NAEAC better than he found it, and his effort and desire for improvement have been successful.

G Shackell thanked R Hazelwood for his comments noting he had joined a committee of impressive people. He had enjoyed his time on the committee and was happy the good work the committee delivered would continue.

O 2. Confirmation of previous minutes

The draft minutes of the general meeting held on 29 July 2021 were reviewed. There were no amendments.

Moved (J Harper/D Wepa):

That the draft minutes of the meeting held on 29 July 2021 be adopted as a true and accurate record of that meeting.

The motion was put: carried.

Action – 9(2)(a) to post redacted July meeting minutes online.

O 3. Action list review

The committee reviewed the status of actions agreed to at previous meetings. The following updates were provided:

Action 2 - Discussion about updating the Good Practice Guide for the Use of Animals in RTT: It was agreed that R Hazelwood and 9(2)(a) discuss the compliance text for the Guide offline.

Action 10 - NAEAC correspondence: 9(2)(a) reported she had not been able to find the email relating to the decapod query.

Action 7 – Public attendance at NAEAC meetings: A Dale referred to legislation regarding public attendance at meetings. It was noted that meetings cannot be recorded without the permission of attendees.

Action 9 - Animal use for practising surgical techniques: A Dale agreed to send through the memorandum of understanding for the organisations the SPCA currently sends cadavers to.

Action 17 - Feedback from ANZCCART conference: M King confirmed that NAEAC will provide an update on its work programme at a future New Zealand ANZCCART conference. It was agreed that AEC newsletters will be forwarded to ANZCCART at the same time they are circulated to animal ethics committees (AECs). This action will be marked as complete.

O 5. Update from NAEAC subcommittees

The NAEAC subcommittee list was circulated prior to the meeting. G Shackell asked the subcommittees whether work relating to the 'AEC workshop', 'vets and research', 'rehoming guidelines' and 'surgical models' should be transferred to the Gantt chart for 2022.

N Harding reported that the work under 'vets and research' could go to the codes of ethical conduct subcommittee. The subcommittee had met the previous week and would hold another meeting mid-December. N Harding also reported that the New Zealand Veterinary Association Conference she was to attend and present at, had been cancelled. However, there would be an opportunity to speak about vets doing research next year.

The committee agreed to the rehoming guidelines being included in the Gantt chart as a deliverable for the first and second quarter of 2022.

Regarding surgical models, it was noted that guidance was being provided by other institutions. It was agreed not to do anything further until such time as the material to be provided by A Dale had been reviewed.

9(2)(a) provided an update on code expirations for 2022. One code will expire in June 2022 and four codes will expire in the last quarter of 2022.

Action - G Shackell to send the Gantt chart to 9(2)(a) to be updated.

O 4. Review of NAEAC work plan

The committee reviewed progress with its 2021 workplan that was circulated prior to the meeting. The following updates were provided:

Informed Public Discussion – Section 1.1.1 Publish Annual Report: G Shackell agreed to draft the majority of the 2021 annual report that would be due to the Minister next year.

Informed Public Discussion – Section 1.1.3 Consolidate Relationship with ANZCCART: The committee discussed the potential of holding a joint meeting with ANZCCART in the third quarter of 2022.

Informed Public Discussion – Section 1.2.1 Provide infographic and information on working of RTT system: NAEAC's expectation was that MPI would lead this piece of work.

Informed Public Discussion – Section 1.3.2 Create re-homing guidelines: It was noted that this topic was briefly discussed earlier and was already incorporated in the work plan.

Good Advice to Minister and DG – Section 2.1.2 Review Part 6 – Fit for Purpose: The work of the codes of ethical conduct subcommittee was ongoing.

Good Advice to Minister and DG – Section 2.3.1 Agree CEC review process: It was noted that 2022 would be a heavy code review year.

Robust ethical RTT system - Section 4.3.2 Meet with Independent Reviewers: NAEAC had not met with accredited reviewers this year but a meeting could be explored in future.

A Dale asked G Shackell if she could provide an update on the work of the codes of ethical conduct subcommittee. A Dale reported that there were still some outstanding pieces of work to progress. These included clarifying what veterinary activity falls under Part 6 of the Act; how non-compliance with codes of ethical conduct, AEC approvals and adverse events are managed. It was noted that ^{9(2)(a)} would be attending NAEAC's February general meeting to discuss how **9(2)(b)(ii)** conducts its parenting arrangements. The subcommittee would use the presentation as a way of identifying how parenting could be improved across other organisations.

It was agreed it was not necessary at this stage to amend the Gantt chart to detail the specific work of the subcommittee.

O 6. Nomination of mini-tutorial topics for 2022

G Shackell invited committee members to nominate mini-tutorial topics for next year. It was already noted that **9(2)(a)** from **9(2)(b)(ii)** would be presenting at the February general meeting. Other suggestions made were as follows:

N Harding suggested Māori aspects of using animals in research, testing and teaching. M King advised he could arrange for a colleague from the University of Otago to speak to this topic.

A Dale suggested **9(2)(a)** talking about the way **9(2)(b)(ii)** rehomes its research animals.

N Waran suggested the topic of developing a kaupapa Māori approach to consideration of use of animals in research/teaching. It was noted that this should inform discussion on the use of animals in research and teaching in NZ and in the development of new codes. It was suggested that this could also be a joint topic related to incorporating indigenous perspectives in use of animals for research and teaching with ANZCCART later next year.

M King raised the incorporation of Mātauranga Māori and whether there is scope for this to be incorporated into Part 6 of the Act. Further discussion will be required on this and may require liaison with ANZCCART as they are currently doing work in this area.

M King agreed to raise the possibility of a meeting addressing indigenous perspectives with ANZCCART as they were meeting the following week.

Actions:

M King to raise idea of a meeting focussed on incorporating Indigeneity next ANZCAART meeting

9(2)(a) to resend the Mātauranga Māori workshop material to committee

O 7. Zebrafish and approval of text for website

G Shackell referred committee members to the memo and previous advice to the Minister on zebrafish that was circulated prior to the meeting. NAEAC had agreed to summarise its original advice on zebrafish and post on its new website. The draft summary text had been incorporated into the memo. G Shackell opened the floor for the committee to discuss this.

N Waran asked whether the age of the animal (i.e. the number of days old it is) should be included in the last paragraph. It was noted that reference to this was included midway through the document.

M King suggested that the opinion piece could be clearer about what it was about – fish, after their yolk sac larval stage, are animals. The committee briefly discussed the definition of an animal and agreed the end of yolk larval stage is a good measure due to the yolk sac being highly visible and easy for people to use.

It was agreed to give both the memo and original advice to an MPI's Communications Adviser to redraft.

Moved (N Waran/J Duckworth):

That NAEAC approve the memo wording in principle, subject to further review from MPI Communications.

The motion was put: carried.

Actions:

9(2)(a) to provide Communications Adviser with zebrafish correspondence to review.

9(2)(a) to circulate amended opinion to NAEAC for final review before posting on the website.

O 8. Review and approval of NAEAC statement on the forced swim test

G Shackell referred committee members to the draft statement circulated prior to the meeting.

R Hazelwood reminded the committee they had agreed to review their current statement on the forced swim test.

A change to the wording in the second to last paragraph was agreed on - *encourage* to be replaced with *reminds*, as it is a legal requirement.

It was agreed to delete the first sentence of the last paragraph and move the last two paragraphs to the top of the page.

The committee discussed that whilst the forced swim test is not an appropriate model for human depression, it should not preclude the forced swim test being appropriate in another model.

N Waran noted this could be made clearer and addressed in the first sentence, using the wording “*should always be looking for alternatives*” and recommended the MPI Communications team also review this prior to it being published.

Moved: (R Hazelwood/J Harper):

The NAEAC statement on the forced swim test is to be updated with the suggested changes and reviewed by MPI Communications prior to upload on the NAEAC website.

The motion was put: carried.

The committee also discussed the potential of developing a Communications plan for 2022.

Actions:

9(2)(a) to arrange review of forced swim test statement by MPI Communications.

9(2)(a) to arrange upload of forced swim test statement to NAEAC website after final review by NAEAC.

9(2)(a) to put Communications plan on agenda for Feb 2022 committee meeting

O 9. Approval of NAEAC guidelines on public attendance at meetings

9(2)(a) provided an update on the guidelines for public attendance at meetings. It was noted that whilst these guidelines were agreed to in May, a review by MPI Legal after the July general meeting, deemed some sections were non-compliant with the Local Government Official Information and Meetings Act 1987 (LGOIMA). The committee reviewed the amended guidelines page by page.

It was agreed to accept all the tracked changes under the ‘introduction’ heading.

Under the ‘meeting dates and papers’ heading there was discussion about how many days prior to the meeting, papers should be posted online. It was noted that **9(2)(a)** had allowed for 10 days prior to the meeting. There was discussion as to whether this should be 2 days (as per requirements of LGOIMA), 10 to 2 days, no more than 10 working days or simply in a ‘timely fashion’. It was generally agreed, that rather than trying to determine this now, NAEAC simply say that meeting papers will be posted on the NAEAC website.

Under ‘public attendance at meetings’ it was agreed to delete the first and second paragraphs in this section. The paragraph relating to waitlisting members of the public could also be deleted.

The discussion of this agenda item was adjourned to accommodate the attendance of the Minister, Hon Meka Whaitiri to the meeting at 11.45 am via Microsoft Teams.

Minister Whaitiri took the opportunity to thank G Shackell for his work with NAEAC and the National Animal Welfare Advisory Committee (NAWAC) over the last six years. G Shackell's research background was noted to have benefited both Committees during that time. The challenges NAEAC faced as a result of COVID-19 was acknowledged. NAEAC's achievements from 2020, including its use of te reo Māori and celebrating achievements in science (e.g. the Three Rs award) were noted.

N Waran, J Duckworth and L Bennett were congratulated on their appointments to the committee. It was noted Minister Whaitiri looked forward to continuing to engage with the committee in the following years. G Shackell thanked the Minister for her kind words after which she left the meeting.

The committee returned to the discussion of agenda item O9.

Under 'meeting procedures' it was agreed to delete the paragraphs numbered 13, 14 and 21.

Moved: (N Waran/J Harper):

The NAEAC guidelines on public attendance at meetings will be updated with the agreed changes, circulated for one final review, and be uploaded to the NAEAC website once finalised.

The motion was put: carried.

O 10. Update on amendments to the *Good Practice Guide*

G Shackell invited R Hazelwood to lead the discussion of this agenda item. R Hazelwood reported that the wording of shall/must/should was amended throughout the document to better align with the definitions in section 1.2 of the Guide. This is what the committee had agreed to at previous meetings. It was agreed to further discuss the use and meaning of the words 'shall' and 'must' at the first meeting of 2022. 9(2)(a) was asked to add this to the agenda.

In relation to section 4.12.8 (appropriate use of teleconferences and videoconferences), the committee discussed the minimum requirements for face-to-face meetings and its feasibility if impacted by COVID-19. L Bennet noted NAEAC would need to be flexible on this issue. The committee agreed to some minor changes to bullet points in this section and R Hazelwood agreed to amend the Guide.

The meeting adjourned for lunch at 12.45 pm and resumed again at 1.15 pm.

It was agreed that reference to compassion fatigue should be removed from Section 4.13.1. The committee agreed that AECs can consider compassion fatigue where relevant and it was better to be included in the staff management section rather than in the criteria for consideration of applications. It was noted that compassion fatigue can have a negative impact on the wellbeing of animals being used in RTT. As such, the committee agreed to include a statement on compassion, with the focus remaining on animal welfare.

N Waran mentioned that Tikanga Māori needed to be included as a statement in the Guide as there was no mention of the Principles of Te Tiriti O Waitangi and the requirement for codes and practice to

consider this. N Waran agreed to draft some appropriate text which would be included on the Background section of the Guide.

The committee discussed section 5.5 on Adverse Events. R Hazelwood clarified this refers only to atypical adverse events which were not expected or detailed in the original application. Any others require immediate reporting. The committee discussed the definition of *adverse* and it was agreed this would be picked up by the codes of ethical conduct subcommittee.

R Hazelwood updated the document throughout the discussion to reflect the committee's suggestions. M King thanked R Hazelwood for his efforts and the attention to detail he had displayed on updating this publication.

Actions:

9(2)(a) to add discussion of shall/must/should to February meeting agenda.

N Waran to draft text on code requirements under Te Tiriti O Waitangi.

R Hazelwood to update GPG as discussed and circulate to NAEAC.

9(2)(a) to arrange publication of the Guide on the NAEAC website.

Code of ethical conduct subcommittee to review the definition of adverse effects.

O 11. Update on euthanasia guidelines

N Harding referred committee members to the amended guidelines circulated prior to the meeting. A Dale confirmed that her request for blunt force trauma to the head (option 1) and shooting (option 2) for feral cats and possums caught in live traps to be swapped around had not yet been made. N Harding reported she would make that change.

In respect to the bullet points under 'general considerations' R Hazelwood noted that human safety should be listed above animal welfare. N Harding agreed to make this change.

It was agreed that NAEAC's commentary on the use of carbon dioxide as a euthanasia method be moved towards the beginning of the document. R Hazelwood mentioned that despite not being recommended practice, carbon dioxide is still widely used in euthanasia. N Harding noted this was the reason for the extensive commentary for this method.

The committee discussed the use of blunt force trauma and agreed this section refer to appropriate training.

On behalf of the committee, G Shackell thanked N Harding for her work on updating the guidelines.

Action: N Harding to make the changes discussed and redistribute.

O 12. Joint meeting with NAWAC on fish

A meeting was held with members of both committees the previous week to finalise the running of the joint meeting on fish. It was noted that many of people attending the meeting would be non-committee members, mostly from MPI. Due to several new appointments on both committees, individuals would be asked to introduce themselves at the start of the day.

It was noted that the speakers had been asked to provide their one good idea, ahead of the meeting. These would be shared at the end of the day and discussed by both committees.

O 13. Update on NAEAC website

Analytics relating to NAEAC hits on the MPI website over the last twelve months were circulated on the morning of the meeting. The NAEAC webpage had 1,933 unique pageviews, with people spending an average of 3 minutes 52 seconds on the page. The NAEAC publications page had 310 unique pageviews.

9(2)(a) also provided an update on the new NAEAC website. Content was currently being uploaded and final testing was underway. Once this was completed, the website would be ready to go live. It was anticipated this would occur by the end of November 2021.

O 14. MPI summary of CEC approvals, notifications, and revocations

The summary of code of ethical conduct approvals, notifications and revocations circulated prior to the meeting was noted.

A Dale asked 9(2)(a) if an updated list on parented organisations could be circulated to the committee prior to the February 2022 meeting. 9(2)(a) agreed to circulate this.

Action – 9(2)(a) to provide list of parented organisations to NAEAC before February general meeting.

O 15. Update on non-human hominid project

9(2)(a) provided an update on the non-human hominid project the committee had previously reviewed.

NAEAC were reminded that anyone wishing to use a non-human hominid in research, testing or teaching must seek approval from MPI, not an AEC. In early 2020 MPI received an application from an individual from 9(2)(b)(ii) who wished to undertake a behavioural project focusing on the chimps at 9(2)(b)(ii). This application was approved with various conditions from MPI. The project was initially delayed due to COVID-19 and then due to 9(2)(b)(ii) undergoing restructuring. The new curator of 9(2)(b)(ii) did not wish to be involved in this project and expressed a lack of resources to have vets watching the chimps as required, as a result the project will no longer go ahead.

O 16. MPI update

The MPI update, circulated prior to the meeting was noted including a number of staff changes in both the Animal Welfare and Policy Teams.

9(2)(a) spoke to the committee about six minor/technical changes relating to animal welfare regulations. It was agreed to circulate a summary document for the committee to review after the meeting.

Action - 9(2)(a) to provide NAEAC with the short summary document detailing the changes to Animal Welfare Regulations.

O 17. Committee members' reports on recent presentations and attendance at conferences

G Shackell invited committee members to comment on recent presentations and attendance at conferences since the last general meeting. The following updates were provided:

- N Waran attended and provided a keynote address at the International Society for Equitation Science: Advancing Equestrian Practice to Improve Equine Quality of Life virtual conference. Topics covered included training and learning theory for horses, pain and stress, and positive affective states.
- N Waran also attended and provided an invited talk at the Companion Animals NZ conference 'Towards a Good Life'. This included overseas attendees and international speakers as it was held virtually. Topics covered included the breeding of companion animals, brachycephalic breeds and quality of life.

O 18. NAEAC correspondence

G Shackell referred committee members to the correspondence log circulated prior to the meeting and provided a summary of the information that he had responded to. It was noted that several pieces of correspondence relating to Lincoln University would need to be transferred to N Waran to sign out as the new NAEAC Chairperson after MPI had drafted the responses.

O 19. Meeting dates for 2022, including site visit

The committee discussed potential meeting dates for 2022, including a site visit and where this should take place. Only the February 2022 meeting date was agreed upon – this would be Thursday, 24 February. Wellington, Palmerston North and Hamilton were suggested locations for the site visit. L Bennet suggested that MPI send out a Doodle poll to determine the other meeting dates and site visit location. 9(2)(a) agreed to do this.

In relation to animal ethics committee meeting attendance, A Dale reported she now sat on the NZeno AEC as the SPCA nominee and had attended her first meeting. G Shackell reported he had attended an Eastern Institute of Technology AEC meeting. M King suggested G Shackell still attend a University of Otago AEC meeting and agreed to put G Shackell in contact with the Chairperson.

Actions:

9(2)(a) to email a poll for preferred dates for 2022 meetings.

M King to put G Shackell in touch with the University of Otago (Dunedin Campus) AEC Chairperson

There being no other items of business to discuss, G Shackell thanked committee members for their attendance and closed the meeting at 2.50 pm. M King performed the closing karakia, which G Shackell followed with a Waiata.