



National Animal Ethics Advisory Committee

NAEAC 02 / 22

Te Komiti Tohutohu Matatika Kararehe ā-Motu
Tikanga hui: General Meeting

Rā: 30 November 2022

Tāima: 9.30 am – 4.00 pm

Whaitua o rēhia: Charles Fergusson Building, 34-38 Bowen Street, Wellington

Meneti | Minutes

Komiti / Committee: Natalie Waran (Chairperson), Arnja Dale, Laura Bennet, Janine Duckworth, Rob Hazelwood, Mike King and Nita Harding

Nuinga / Attendees: 9(2)(a)

Manuhiri / Guests:

Nau mai / Welcome

Due to travel delays N Waran opened the meeting with a karakia at 0953.

Matangaro / Apologies: Rachel Heeney, Jacquie Harper and Dianne Wepa.

Any Other Business Part One (Open to the Public)

Any Other Business Part Two (Public Excluded Agenda)

PART ONE (OPEN TO THE PUBLIC)

O 1. Farewells

N Waran acknowledged this meeting as the final general NAEAC meeting for R Hazelwood and A Dale. She commended the work both members have undertaken over the years before presenting them with their service awards.

^{9(2)(a)} provided an update on the appointment process for their replacements.

O 2. Confirmation of previous minutes

The draft minutes of the general meeting held on 18 August 2022 were reviewed.

Moved: (R Hazelwood / A Dale):

That the draft minutes of the meeting held on 18 August 2022 be adopted as a true and accurate record.

The motion was put: carried.

O 3. Status of actions arising from previous meetings

NAEAC reviewed the status of the action list and updated it accordingly.

N Waran noted the matter of Zebra Fish has been discussed recently with the Minister. N Waran conveyed that this is an issue which NAEAC would like to see progressed. ^{9(2)(a)} confirmed MPI Policy are waiting to be guided by the Minister on the direction to take regarding this matter.

Action: N Waran and ^{9(2)(a)} to write to the Minister following up on Zebra Fish definition, including NAEAC's recommendation.

N Waran informed the committee that other topics discussed with the Minister included the concept of the 4th R and Mātauranga Māori.

J Duckworth noted she has spoken with Māori researchers to discuss the use of traditional methods which are not covered by AEC documentation (e.g., dispatching of Tuna). N Waran recommended NAEAC co-opt people to the Mātauranga Māori sub-committee and that NAEAC should take a Te Ara Tika approach.

R Hazelwood advised the committee should be clear on the issue they are attempting to address.

N Waran recommended that budget is sought to commission a piece of work in this space. This would be undertaken by subject matter experts and a plan would be established for NAEAC. N Waran agreed she will review funding resources.

O 4. NAEAC correspondence

^{9(2)(a)} advised the committee that AECs have been informed of the new system for collecting animal use statistics which will be rolled out to collect Animal Usage Statistics for 2022.

One piece of correspondence was discussed by the committee, as it related to the statistics returns and the definition of death. NAEAC would like more context of the figures relating to death, as these figures may not

always be truly representative. The statistics need to be able to demonstrate the changes in relation to the way that animals are being used in RTT and the 3Rs.

Action: NAEAC to discuss with AEC Chairs on the additional information NAEAC would like to seek in relation to the animal use statistics returns.

O 5. MPI update

The paper was circulated prior to the meeting and was taken as read.

Regarding the proposed regulations for dog tethering outlined in the memorandum, R Hazelwood requested a definition of *tethering* and A Dale confirmed there will be example indicators alongside these.

9(2)(a) provided an update on a new Animal Products Regulation (118). The new regulation means that animals used in research, testing and teaching will need to be approved by Animal Products before they can enter the food chain. Guidance for AECs and those seeking AEC approval is currently being developed by MPI Animal Products and will be circulated in due course.

Action: 9(2)(a) **to circulate further detail on this regulation and guidance as it develops.**

9(2)(a) provided an update on MPI staffing changes and current resource allocation. Recruitment for a second Animal Welfare Science Team Manager is underway as the team is being restructured due to an increase in size.

O 6. MPI summary of CEC approvals, notifications, and revocations

The paper was circulated prior to the meeting and was taken as read.

N Waran sought feedback from the committee on any aspects of the MPI summary.

9(2)(a) thanked the committee for their work on the CEC reviews which took place over the last few of months. 3 CECs (Victoria University, Canterbury University and South Pacific Sera) were recommended to MPI for approval and the gazette notices have been published.

The paperwork for 2 CECs (9(2)(a) and 9(2)(a)) are currently with 9(2)(a) and will be gazetted shortly.

1 CEC (Te Pukenga) is progressing through the process and once revised, the code will be circulated to the whole committee for review.

N Waran updated the committee on the progression of the Te Pukenga merger.

R Hazelwood queried 9(2)(a) parenting arrangement due to the location of the parented organisation being a significant distance away.

M King recommended the Good Practice Guide be updated to include guidance for organisations who are parented. The committee agreed.

Action: Good Practice Guide to be updated to include guidance for parented organisations.

9(2)(a) advised this could be championed when reviewing codes of ethical conduct and the CEC template could be updated to ensure expectations of parenting arrangements are clear.

N Waran sought clarity on why parenting arrangements are not recommended by NAEAC in the same way CECs are. ^{9(2)(a)} confirmed this is due to the requirements of the Animal Welfare Act.

NAEAC discussed whether they should have an oversight and/or approval role in the parenting arrangements.

Action: ^{9(2)(a)} to write a paper on the requirements of Act and NAEACs options for duty of care in relation to parenting arrangements.

Action: Two members of NAEAC to write to ^{9(2)(a)} to request a site visit in early 2023.

O 7. Update from NAEAC sub-committees

The Chair asked each sub-committee chair to report back on progress/updates on the workstreams and engagement since the last general meeting:

The John Schofield 3Rs Award: ^{9(2)(a)} updated NAEAC on the sub-committees selected winner. Letters confirming the decisions made on applications will be sent imminently.

Mātauranga Māori: A meeting is scheduled for 13th December 2022 to discuss the development of a workplan and co-opting members.

Code of Ethical Conduct Review Process: A written update was circulated prior to meeting and was taken as read.

Rehoming Guidelines: The sub-committee will schedule an initial scoping meeting and report back to the committee in early 2023.

Surgical Models: The purpose of this sub-committee is to develop a guidance document on the use of cadavers. A meeting is to be scheduled to develop a work programme and Terms of Reference.

NAEAC Publications: The sub-committee have several more amendments to make to the Good Practice Guide and aim to bring this to the first NAEAC meeting of 2023.

FOR APPROVAL

O 8. NAEAC Workplan 2023

The paper was circulated prior to the meeting and was taken as read.

N Waran asked for feedback from the committee on the proposed workplan and ^{9(2)(a)} informed the committee of the resourcing available.

Key items the committee would like to see included on the workplan for 2023 are:

- Mātauranga Māori; As discussed earlier in the meeting, N Waran will review funding options.
- Animal Usage Statistic returns; NAEAC wish to explore what additional information can be sought to provide greater meaning to the figures.
- A strategic planning meeting for 2023.

Action: ^{9(2)(a)} to update and circulate the workplan for 2023. This will be brought to the first general NAEAC meeting of 2023 for approval.

DISCUSSION

O 9. CEC Review Topics

The paper was circulated prior to the meeting and was taken as read.

R Hazelwood confirmed that the revised Good Practice Guide addresses several issues outlined in the memorandum.

The committee agreed that the four key changes made to the Good Practice Guide should be highlighted in a 2023 AEC newsletter.

Action: ^{9(2)(a)} to include a highlight of the changes made to the Good Practice Guide from the 2022 CEC review round in the AEC newsletter in 2023.

R Hazelwood confirmed that the Good Practice Guide now states decision making should be made via consensus and word "vote" has been removed from the document.

NAEAC discussed the nuances and legalities of the use of the words *Shall* and *Must*. It was agreed that a definition will be included in the Good Practice Guide.

O 10. AEC Newsletter Process

The paper was circulated prior to the meeting and was taken as read. The purpose of this paper was to showcase how the Animal Welfare Science is implementing quality management strategies (including process mapping) to streamline their work. NAEAC provided positive feedback on the QMS and the work being undertaken by ^{9(2)(a)} in this space.

J Duckworth recommended the processes are downloaded and saved externally from the software to ensure it is always accessible.

NAEAC discussed the timeframes for the AEC newsletters and agreed one is to be circulated in December 2022 and the next in March-April 2023.

The committee adjourned the meeting for lunch at 1210.

O 11. Nomination of mini-tutorial topics for 2023

The committee reconvened at 1300.

N Waran sought feedback from the wider committee on suggested mini-tutorial topics for 2023 and the following suggestions were made:

- **Mātauranga Māori.**

^{9(2)(a)}

(2)

^{9(2)(a)}

○

^{9(2)(a)}

○

^{9(2)(a)}

– M King will contact directly.

- **The Aotearoa New Zealand John Schofield 3 Rs Implementation Award:** The winner of the 2022 award to present to NAEAC on their application.

- **The 4th R and how this can be operationalised:** A Dale, M King and ^{9(2)(a)}

- **"The Badness of Death"** – M King

NAEAC noted they will need to establish the question they hope the mini-tutorial on Mātauranga Māori will address. The committee discussed the previous joint workshop with NAWAC on Mātauranga Māori in 2019 and suggested this could be a topic addressed jointly in 2023.

Action: ^{9(2)(a)} to contact NAWAC and propose a 2023 joint meeting on Mātauranga Māori.

Action: ^{9(2)(a)} to contact suggested speakers and propose dates of meetings for them to deliver their mini-tutorial.

O 12. AEC Workshop Feedback

NAEAC were asked to provide feedback on the AEC workshop and site visits which took place in October 2022.

Positive feedback was received on the following:

- Good turnout
- Collaborative vibe
- Good panel discussion
- Great session on Mātauranga Māori which will be covered as an ongoing workstream for NAEAC.

Challenges noted during feedback include:

- Some IT issues in the physical room
- Ensuring all participants and members of the audience can hear each other.

Suggestions for the next AEC workshop:

- At least one breakout session to improve interaction, with a focus on concepts (4th R, Mātauranga Māori, Adverse Events)
- Short introductions at the start
- A scenario-based session; this could incorporate openness.

NAEAC discussed the workshop attendance and agreed that an attendance record should be kept of those who express interest and those who attend.

Action: ^{9(2)(a)} to update the AEC Workshop Attendance List and bring this back to the next NAEAC meeting.

^{9(2)(a)} joined the meeting at 1330.

Action: ^{9(2)(a)} to develop an AEC Workshop Ideas Document for the NAEAC planning session.

O 13. Social License to Operate - Kind Education Report 2021 (NZAVS)

The paper was circulated prior to the meeting and was taken as read.

N Waran noted the good feedback provided by R Heeney via email when this was circulated to the committee.

A Dale informed the committee that New Zealand Anti-Vivisection Society submitted requests under the Official Information Act to several schools to retrieve the data on animals used in teaching at schools.

R Hazelwood highlighted that 80% of responding schools abstain from the use of animals and that this could result in children missing opportunities/important experiences that come from interacting with sentient creatures. L Bennet shared these sentiments, noting that learning to care for animals should be a vital part of education and informed the committee of the success of trials where children read to dogs.

The committee discussed that there is likely a lack of knowledge / information in schools regarding the regulations surrounding the use of animals for teaching.

N Waran informed the committee that the Minister did ask several questions relating to this report at their latest meeting.

A Dale highlighted there is a study which she will re-circulate with the committee which provides detail and figures of animals used in teaching / schools on a global scale.

NAEAC discussed the use of animals and learning methodology, highlighting several studies have shown where material is knowledge based, students perform higher without an animal model.

NAEAC acknowledged that teaching should account for 1/3rd of their work focus.

The committee discussed arranging a meeting with the AEC for Schools (Ministry of Education) and the suggestion was made that NAEAC offer to work together in response to the NZAVS report. It was noted that there is a new AEC Chair for Schools.

A Dale to confirmed that ^{9(2)(a)} is now the Chair of the AEC for Schools.

^{9(2)(a)} advised that ANZCCART are considering reaching out to schools without an AEC and to get champions in schools. A Dale noted there are forums for biology / science teachers to connect, R Heeney will be connected to these forums.

The committee agreed they would engage with Schools AEC Chair and Educators Forum and incorporate Animals used in teaching into the work programme for 2023. A sub-committee will be established to action this work.

Action: Animals used in teaching to be incorporated into the 2023 workplan.

Action: N Waran to approach R Heeney to chair the teaching sub-committee.

O 14. NAEAC website

^{9(2)(a)} confirmed that the committee will have portrait headshots taken at their first general meeting in 2023 and the website blurbs will be updated once the two new committee members have been officially appointed.

J Duckworth recommended that the Good Practice Guide is to be separated from the list of documents on the NAEAC website and instead be highlighted in its own section due to its high importance for stakeholders.

^{9(2)(a)} advised that a communications plan was drafted by ^{9(2)(a)} and will require input from the committee to progress this further. N Waran requested that a communications adviser is assigned to NAEAC to continuing guiding and actioning these work items.

^{9(2)(a)} updated NAEAC that recruitment for a communications adviser is underway.

Action: Once a communications adviser has been appointed, they will work alongside N Waran and J Duckworth to continue developing the communication plan for NAEAC.

OTHER BUSINESS

O 15. Committee members' reports on recent presentations and attendance at conferences

N Harding: Attended a DOC AEC meeting and presented on use of carbon dioxide as a method of euthanasia. Feedback was received on the use of carbon dioxide for rat euthanasia and the euthanasia guidelines will be amended accordingly before they are provided to ^{9(2)(a)} to update on the NAEAC website.

Action: N Harding to update the euthanasia guidelines

Action: ^{9(2)(a)} to upload the updated euthanasia guideline to the NAEAC website.

J Duckworth: Attended a Lincoln University AEC meeting.

M King: Attended the Australasian Bioethics seminar.

L Bennet: Attended a Stem Cell Conference which focused on pre-clinical and clinical research for new-born babies with Cerebral Palsy and a conference in the UK which focused on climate change and sustainability in pregnancy.

N Waran: Recently returned from a business trip to South Africa where she addressed equine welfare, the use of horses in competitive sports and sustainability.

O 16. Meeting dates for 2023

N Waran proposed the following meeting dates:

- 8th February 2023 - Wellington
- 5th April 2023 - Wellington (2 CECs to be reviewed)
- 23rd – 24th May 2023 - ^{9(2)(a)}
- 2nd August 2023 – Joint NAWAC meeting (tentative)
- 23rd August 2023 - Virtual
- 3rd – 4th October - Wellington (5 CECs to be reviewed)
- 29th November 2023 – Virtual

The committee agreed to the dates proposed and N Waran closed the meeting with a karakia at 1440.